

**Provision of Annual Board Appraisal Services**

**Invitation to Tender**

**May 2025**

**COMMENCING 2025 FOR THREE YEARS,**

**SUBJECT TO ANNUAL REVIEW,**

**WITH THE POSSIBILITY FOR EXTENSION FOR A FURTHER TWO YEARS**

Contents

[1. Introduction 3](#_Toc197520393)

[1.1 Cadder Housing Association 3](#_Toc197520394)

[1.2 The Annual Board Appraisal Process 4](#_Toc197520395)

[2. Completion and submission of proposal 4](#_Toc197520396)

[3. Tender Return Instructions: 5](#_Toc197520397)

[4. Confidentiality of information 5](#_Toc197520398)

[5. Timetable 5](#_Toc197520399)

[6. Evaluation methodology 6](#_Toc197520400)

[7. Contractual Terms, Monitoring and Fees 8](#_Toc197520401)

[7.1 Contractual terms 8](#_Toc197520402)

[7.2 Monitoring 8](#_Toc197520403)

[7.3 Fees 8](#_Toc197520404)

[8. Specification, Scope and Responsibilities 8](#_Toc197520405)

[9. Proposed Timetable 9](#_Toc197520406)

[10. Prevention and detection of irregularities 10](#_Toc197520407)

[11. Supplementary Information 11](#_Toc197520408)

[12. Independence 11](#_Toc197520409)

[13. Instructions for the Preparation of Submission Statement 11](#_Toc197520410)

[14. Submission Statement 11](#_Toc197520411)

[14.1 Contract Management (15%) 12](#_Toc197520412)

[14.2 Service Delivery (25%) 12](#_Toc197520413)

[14.3 Knowledge and Experienced of Scottish RSL Sector (20%) 12](#_Toc197520414)

[14.4 Experience of Review Team (10%) 13](#_Toc197520415)

[15. Termination of Appointment 13](#_Toc197520416)

[16. APPENDIX A – Quality Submission Statement 14](#_Toc197520417)

[17. APPENDIX B – Historical Client Base 21](#_Toc197520418)

[18. APPENDIX C – Fee Bid Form 23](#_Toc197520419)

# Introduction

## 1.1 Cadder Housing Association

Cadder Housing Association (CHA) was established in 1993 and is a community-based housing association that aims to provide high quality housing and services to our tenants and other customers.  We evolved through 2 large scale housing transfers from Scottish Homes in 1994 and 1998. The Association now owns 697 properties and provides factoring management services to 405 owner-occupiers.

CHA is a registered social landlord, Registered with the Financial Conduct Authority 2436R (S), Scottish Housing Regulator HCB 270, a registered Scottish Charity, SCO36455 and a Registered Property Factor, PF000259. Any surpluses made are re-invested in the upkeep and maintenance of our area and properties, and also ensures the provision of high-quality services in our work.

CHA also operates a Community Hub as part of the Association which provides room and function hiring, café, gym and a range of community groups and other activities.

CHA offices share a building with the Community Hub.

We currently also have a maintenance unit which is approximately 1 mile away from our main office.

The Association is managed by a Board, where members work in a voluntary capacity to oversee the running of the organisation and make the key strategic decisions associated with our work.

The Association is required to work within the regulatory framework set by the Scottish Housing Regulator.

As at 31st March 2024, our annual revenue is £4M and Net Assets are £9M.

Additional information about CHA’s structure and activities can be obtained from our website [www.cadderha.co.uk](http://www.cadderha.co.uk)

1.2 The Annual Board Appraisal Process

The annual appraisal of our Board has the following important roles:

1. To facilitate a process to enable the Board to assess their effectiveness individually and collectively as Board members and as a governing body.
2. To identify any areas in performance that could be improved on by or for existing members, and those which may be addressed by attracting individuals with a particular skill set.
3. To assist in succession planning.
4. To identify training requirements, collectively and individually, and therefore develop an appropriate training plan for members.
5. To ensure adherence to the nine-year requirement by Board members and to ensure a process that enables the required demonstration of effectiveness.
6. To ensure compliance with the Associations Rules and the Scottish Housing Regulator (SHR) Regulatory Framework requirements.

To prevent any potential perception of a conflict of interest in the Board performance review process, the Association chooses to use the services of an external independent governance specialist reviewer to undertake the annual review work. This tender process is to secure the appointment of such a specialist for this purpose for the period identified.

# Completion and submission of proposal

The Association currently undertakes annual Board performance reviews and is committed to continuing this vital risk management and assurance process.

The Board of Cadder Housing Association wishes to tender for this area of work as our current contract has reached the end of its term. As such the Association now invites organisations to tender.

This invitation to tender is for the provision of Board Performance Review services and interested firms should consider in their tender submission the relative complexity and size of the Association.

The purpose of this tendering exercise is to select the specialist for an initial period of three (3) years with a possible extension to five (5) years by negotiation during year 3. The contract shall be renewable on an annual basis, at the sole discretion of the Association and subject to satisfactory review.

# Tender Return Instructions:

The following instructions should be strictly adhered to, as any deviation may result in tenders not being opened or considered.

Please direct any queries or requests for further information to **Pamela Milne, Chief Executive Officer** by **Friday 16th May 2025**. Please make any required contact by e-mail to **pamela.milne@cadderhousing.co.uk**

Please return your tender by email to **pamela.milne@cadderhousing.co.uk**

Please mark you tender: **‘Board Appraisal Services Tender - Private & Confidential’**

By: **12 noon Friday 30th May 2025**

Cadder Housing Association will not be liable to reimburse any costs incurred by you during this process.

# Confidentiality of information

All information contained in the invitation to tender is confidential. Likewise, all information included by the tenderer in their proposals will be treated in confidence. Compliance with the General Data Protection Regulation and the Freedom of Information (Scotland) Act 2002 is required.

# Timetable

The timetable for this 2025 process is as follows:

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Stage of Process** | **Date By:** |
| * Issue of Invitation To Tender (ITT)
 | Friday 9th May 2025 |
| * Requests for further information/clarification
 | Friday 16th May 2025Responses will be provided by Wednesday 21st May 2025 |
| * Return of ITT
 | 12 noon Friday 30th May 2025 |
| * Presentations by Shortlisted Suppliers (if required)
 | To be determined |
| * Award of Contract
 | 30th June 2025 |
| * Contract Start Date
 | 1st July 2025 |
| * Determine Scope and Programme for 2025/26 process
 | w/c 14th July 2025 |

# Evaluation methodology

Evaluation of submissions will be carried out based on the information provided in the submission and fee statements. The Association will, if necessary, contact tenderers to seek clarification of any aspect of their quotation.

Shortlisted providers may be invited to present and discuss their proposals at a selection panel meeting. The presentations will provide tenderers with the opportunity to discuss their tender proposal in more detail.

While the Association is concerned to maximise the value obtained from our tender, it does not bind itself to accept the lowest priced submission. Key criteria will be evaluated. Total scores for each criterion will then be weighted as follows:

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Price | 30% |
| Contract Management  | 15% |
| Service Delivery | 25% |
| Knowledge and Understanding of Scottish RSL Sector | 20% |
| Experience of Team undertaking work | 10% |

**Price Evaluation**

Price will count for **300** marks and will be evaluated on the basis of each Tenderer’s tendered prices.

The lowest tendered price will score full marks for price.

The marks for price for each other Tender will be calculated by the following formula:

 Price of lowest priced Tender

 Price of Tender being evaluated x **300 Marks**

**Quality Questionnaire**

Each element of the Quality Questionnaire will be evaluated and scored on a scale of 0 to 10 as follows:

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| 0 – 1 | No response or insufficient information (non- compliance) |
| 2 – 3 | Unsatisfactory response (potential for some compliance but very major areas of weakness) |
| 4 – 5 | Partially acceptable response but with significant areas of weakness |
| 6 – 7 | Satisfactory and acceptable response (substantial compliance with no major concerns) |
| 8 – 9 | Fully satisfactory /very good response (fully compliant with requirements) |
| 10 | Outstanding response (fully compliant, with some areas exceeding requirements) |

The Quality Questionnaire will be used to assess specific aspects of quality, technical merit and customer service for each Tenderer. The quality questionnaire will count for 700 marks.

The weightings of each of the scored elements within the Method statement Questions will be as follows:

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **Question****(Scored out of 10)** | **Weighting** | **Maximum Mark** |
| Contract Management | x 1.5 | 150 |
| Service Delivery | x 2.5 | 250 |
| Knowledge and Experience of Scottish RSL Sector | x 2.0 | 200 |
| Experience of Review Team | x 1.0 | 100 |

# Contractual Terms, Monitoring and Fees

## 7.1 Contractual terms

The contract shall initially commence 1 July 2025 for three years but may be extended for a further two years. All details in the quotation, including the prices and rates, are for the initial three-year period to 30 June 2028, with any extension subject to negotiation.

The contract with the selected company shall be renewable on an annual basis, at the sole discretion of the Association and subject to satisfactory review.

## 7.2 Monitoring

During the contract, daily liaison will be with the Association’s Chief Executive Officer. You will nominate a person of sufficient seniority to be responsible for the contract.

## 7.3 Fees

Rates should be submitted for the initial period of the contract together with details of how any extension increases (if any) will be calculated. Tenderers are requested to tender for the contract on the basis of stating the proposed number of days per annum, together with the day rate (exclusive of VAT). Prices should be quoted for the period of the contract (i.e. 3 years) by completion of the Fee Bid Form at Appendix C.

# Specification, Scope and Responsibilities

The role of the appraisal process is to provide an objective assessment of whether governance systems and controls are working properly and to identify any associated risk. It is a key part of the Associations internal control system.

The reviewer will be expected to carry out a rolling review process so that an ongoing trend position can be consider as well as outcomes for individual review years.

To provide the required assurance, the process will be undertaken based on the policy and strategy authorised by the Board, which may be subject to change during the contract period.

Whilst the reviewer’s skills and experience will be expected to ensure adequacy of system, the Association recognises that the responsibility for ensuring that appropriate and adequate arrangements are established for internal control rests with the Association.

The reviewer will be responsible for conducting an independent appraisal and giving assessment to the Board. It is for the Board to determine whether to accept and implement recommendations made by the reviewer or, alternatively, for recognising and accepting the risks resulting from not taking an action.

The appraisal process will consider the adequacy of systems and controls necessary to secure effectiveness in all areas. It will seek to confirm that the Association has taken the necessary steps to achieve effective governance.

The provision of service should be undertaken over a number of days per annum, which typically include the following activities:

* + Preparation and review of adequacy of approved policy and strategy to ensure review process achieves required outcomes.
	+ Facilitating the collective assessment process involving Board members and staff who service the Board.
	+ Facilitating the reviews with individual Board members to assess
		- Their own effectiveness, including any 9-year assessment.
		- Their view on the effectiveness of other Board members, including any 9 year assessment.
		- Their view on the overall Board collective effectiveness.
		- Their review of the performance of the Chair.
	+ Facilitating the Chairpersons review.
	+ Annual Report to Board (in person attendance required). Annual report to include, as minimal, assessment of appraisal, recommendations for improvements, training needs assessment with training priorities, succession plan and recruitment priorities.
	+ Contract Management.

# Proposed Timetable

The proposed timetable for the various stages is as follows:

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Month | Event /Meeting | Involved | Output |
| To be agreed | Independent reviewer attending Board meeting(s) to observe. | All Board members and staff who service Board meetings. | To provide reviewer with opportunity to assess Board meeting(s). |
| October | Board Collective Assessment Workshop | All Board members and staff who service committee meetings. | Collective assessment completed. |
| November | Individual Board member meetings with independent appraiser. Undertaking individual assessment (including any 9-year assessments), and development needs review, Chair performance assessment. | All Board members, individually, with independent appraiser. | Assessment of individuals’ contribution and identification of any training needs. |
|  | Chair’s review and feedback meeting. | Chair, CEO, and independent appraiser. | Chair’s annual review, training needs assessment and any required changes in approach. |
| February | Independent Appraiser's Report on annual performance review. | All Board members and staff who service Board meetings. | Annual Appraisal Report.Recommendations for improvements.Training priorities.Succession Plan and recruitment priorities. |
| March | Independent appraiser attending Board meeting to present Report to Board on annual performance appraisal. | All Board members and staff who service Board meetings. | As above. |
| May Reported to June Board Meeting | Review of policy and process.  | All Board members, independent appraiser and staff who service Board meetings. | Suitable and robust policy and process for following year. |

It is on the above basis that bidders should tender.

# Prevention and detection of irregularities

The Association has responsibility for the prevention, detection, and investigation of irregularities, including fraud and corruption. If the appraiser becomes aware of fraud or irregularity the CEO and Chairperson should be informed immediately in order to record the matter and agree on the further action to be taken.

The reviewer will be responsible for providing relevant, reliable, and sufficient evidence to form the basis of their findings and for making recommendations for improvements to current practice.

The Association is seeking a provider that is fully familiar and experienced with the operation and the legal and regulatory environment in which Scottish RSLs function.

# Supplementary Information

The following documents are amongst many that are available from our website by way of supplementary information:

* Annual Financial Statements
* Annual Reports and Charter Reports
* Business Plan
* Management Accounts
* SHR Returns

[www.cadderha.co.uk](http://www.cadderha.co.uk)

# Independence

The appraisal service has no executive role, nor does it have any responsibility for the development, implementation, or operation of systems. However, it may provide independent and objective assessment and advice on risk management, control and governance, value for money and related matters, subject to resource constraints. The appraiser has right of access to the Association’s CEO and Chairperson.

Within the Association, responsibility for risk management, control and governance arrangements and the achievement of value for money rests with the Board who should ensure that appropriate and adequate arrangements exist. Where there are differences of opinion between the appraiser and management, the Board should ultimately determine whether or not to accept appraisal recommendations, recognise and accept the risks of not acting, and instruct management to implement recommendations or otherwise.

# Instructions for the Preparation of Submission Statement

This tender will be evaluated on the basis of a review and measurement of the general content quality of the submission through the information detailed within the completed Submission Statement (your response to the requirements set out in the specification) and the Fee Bid Form details.

The Contract will be awarded on the basis of a Quality/Price ratio of 70% Quality, 30% Price. Criteria and scoring to be used in relation to the assessment of quality are set out in the submission statement.

Companies should note that failure to provide the information requested in the Submission Statement may result in their tender being rejected.

# Submission Statement

Please respond to the following questions on the attached Appendix A - C:

## 14.1 Contract Management (15%)

Provide details of your organisation in relation to its governance structure, including the location of your head office.

Provide information as to how the quality of your service is established and monitored, including performance review.

Outline your proposals to ensure effective communication and liaison with relevant employees of the Association.

Outline the main challenges posed by the commission, and outline how you would propose to resolve those challenges.

Outline the arrangements that you would adopt to manage any potential conflict of interest arising during the contract.

Detail how the service you would provide will comply with relevant good practice and any legislative requirements.

Please confirm that you have a Data Protection Policy, an Equalities and Diversity Policy, and a Health and Safety Policy. Copies of these will be sought from the successful tenderer.

Please give details of your Professional Indemnity Insurance.

## 14.2 Service Delivery (25%)

Provide details on how the appraisal is established and how the annual Report is developed.

Provide two example appraisal reports you have prepared and provided, preferably for RSLs.

Set out the key steps you see to production of the final report with an indication of the timescale at each stage.

Indicate the level of input you would expect from Cadder HA staff.

Provide two examples of how you have added value to your clients using the knowledge you have gained from the performance appraisal process.

Describe the approach you will adopt for carrying out services for Cadder HA and what your proposed workplan is, including target response times and use of IT.

## 14.3 Knowledge and Experienced of Scottish RSL Sector (20%)

Provide details of your Company’s performance appraisal experience in the RSL sector and give details of when this was acquired.

The Association is seeking a provider that is fully familiar and experienced with the operating and the legal, regulatory, and good practice environment in which Scottish RSLs function. Please provide details of the RSLs your firm currently provides such services to in Scotland.

For each client mentioned above, please detail their size and complexity.

Indicate your ability to advise on new relevant legislative requirements and guidance and detail how you would do this.

Provide details of three similar organisations whom we may contact for a reference. Details should include a named contact and email, telephone, and postal contact details for that person.

## 14.4 Experience of Review Team (10%)

Detail the proposed team, identifying all relevant personnel to be allocated to the commission, identifying roles and responsibilities. You should also indicate any personnel who may be involved in a reserve capacity, in the absence of any of the main team.

For all team members identified above, please provide details of:

* their job title and role within the company.
* their qualifications.
* the date they joined your firm.
* their experience within the Scottish RSL environment.
* their experience of RSL governance and regulatory environment.
* their experience, if any, in developing good practice/guidance on RSL governance.
* relevant training/continuous professional development they undertake.

Identify who will be responsible for the contract demonstrating why their skills and expertise would be significant to a successful service to the Association.

Demonstrate that the appropriate mix of skills is available within the proposed team to meet the Association’s requirements.

# Termination of Appointment

The contract shall be renewable on an annual basis, at the sole discretion of the Association and subject to satisfactory review.

In the event of serious shortcomings on the part of the selected company, the Board may terminate the contract with immediate effect, without compensation, notwithstanding any agreement between them and the Association.

Either party can end the contact at any time by providing three months written notice.

# APPENDIX A – Quality Submission Statement

|  |
| --- |
| Name of Company:  |
| Project: **Board Performance Appraisal Contract** |

|  |
| --- |
| **Contract Management (15%)** |
| Provide details of your organisation in relation to its governance structure. |  |
| Provide information as to how the quality of your service is established and monitored, including performance review. |  |
| Outline your proposals to ensure effective communication and liaison with relevant employees of the association. |  |
| Outline the main challenges posed by this commission, and outline how you would propose to resolve those challenges. |  |
| Outline the arrangements that you would adopt to manage any potential conflict of interest arising during the commission. |  |
| Detail how the service you would provide will comply with relevant good practice and any legislative requirements. |  |
| Please confirm that you have a Data Protection Policy, an Equalities and Diversity Policy, and a Health and Safety Policy. Copies of these will be sought from the successful tenderer. |  |
| Please give details of your Professional Indemnity Insurance. |  |

|  |
| --- |
| **Service Delivery (25%)** |
| Provide details on how the appraisal is established and how the annual Report is developed.  |  |
| Provide two example appraisal reports you have prepared and provided, preferably for RSLs.  |  |
| Set out the key steps you see to production of the final report with an indication of the timescale at each stage. |  |
| Indicate the level of input you would expect from Cadder HA staff. |  |
| Provide two examples of how you have added value to your clients using the knowledge you have gained from the performance appraisal process. |  |
| Describe the approach you will adopt for carrying out services for Cadder HA and what your proposed workplan is, including target response times and use of IT. |  |

|  |
| --- |
| **Knowledge and Experienced of Scottish RSL Sector (20%)** |
| Provide details of your Company’s performance appraisal experience in the RSL sector and give details of when this was acquired. The Association is seeking a provider that is fully familiar and experienced with the operating and the legal, regulatory, and good practice environment in which Scottish RSLs function. Please provide details of the RSLs your firm currently provides services to in Scotland. |  |
| For each client mentioned above, please detail their size and complexity. |  |
| Indicate your ability to advise on new relevant legislation and guidance and detail how you would do this. |  |
| Provide details of three similar organisations which we may contact for a reference. Details should include a named contact and email, telephone, and postal contact details for that person. At the separate section below, please provide the details of every Scottish RSL that you have worked with over the past three years. You should note that the Association may randomly select previous clients for reference audit purposes. |  |

|  |
| --- |
| **Experience of Team (10%)** |
| Detail the proposed team, identifying all relevant personnel to be allocated to the commission, identifying roles and responsibilities. You should also indicate any personnel who may be involved in a reserve capacity, in the absence of any of the main team.  |  |
| For all team members identified above, please provide details of:* their job title and role within the company.
* their qualifications.
* the date they joined your firm.
* their experience within the Scottish RSL environment.
* their experience of RSL governance and regulatory environment.
* their experience, if any, in developing good practice/guidance on RSL governance.
* relevant training/continuous professional development they undertake.
 |  |
| Identify who will be responsible for the contract demonstrating why their skills and expertise would be significant to a successful service to the Association. |  |
| Demonstrate that the appropriate mix of skills is available within the proposed team to meet the Association’s requirements. |  |

Signed: \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_

For: \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_

Date: \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_

# APPENDIX B – Historical Client Base

|  |
| --- |
| **Scottish RSL Clients**  |
|  |  |

# APPENDIX C – Fee Bid Form

|  |
| --- |
| Name of Company:  |
| Project: **Board Performance Appraisal Contract** |
| **FEE BID**

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Element / Year** | **2025/6** | **2026/7** | **2027/8** |
| **Days proposed and element breakdown.** |  |  |  |
| **Daily Rate:** |  |  |  |
| **Expenses Rates:** |  |  |  |
| **Any additions / ongoing costs:** |  |  |  |
| **Net Total:** |  |  |  |
| **VAT Rate:** |  |  |  |
| **Gross Total:** |  |  |  |

**Extension Increase Intention:**

|  |
| --- |
|  |

It would be useful if you could provide a costed schedule indicating how the above figures are arrived at.Signed: \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_For: \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_Date: \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_ |